

**Coconino County Planning and Zoning Commission
Meeting of March January 6, 2021
Held Through Web-Based Technology -ZOOM**

Members Present

Tammy Ontiveros–Madam Chair
Don Walters – Vice-Chair
Sat Best
Ray Mayer
John Ruggles
Tyanna Burton
Jim Clifford

Members Absent

Mary Williams

Staff Present

Jason Christelman, Director
Jess McNeely, Assistant Director
Bob Short, Principal. Planner
Zach Schwartz, Sr. Planner
Aaron Lumpkin, County Attorney
Marty Hernandez, Recording Secretary

Madam Chair Ontiveros called the meeting to order at 5:30PM. She noted procedures to the audience.

I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION: Commissioner Walters made the motion to approve the minutes from December 2, 2020.

SECOND: Commissioner Clifford seconded.

DISCUSSION: N/A

ABSTAIN: Chair Ontiveros abstained.

VOTE: All other Commissioners voted to approve the Minutes.

III. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Case No. ZC-19-009: A request for a Zone Change from RR-4 (Rural Residential, 4-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to RR-2 (Rural Residential, 2-acre minimum parcel size) Zone on four parcels totaling 36.9 acres. The properties are located at 101 E Moonrise Valley, 412 E Moonrise Valley, 4363 N Quintana and 155 E Moonrise Valley in Lockett Ranches and are also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 110-12-004C, 110-12-004G, 110-12-004H and 110-12-004J.
Property Owner/Applicant: John Howley, Flagstaff, Arizona
Property Owner: Craig Steele, Flagstaff, Arizona

Property Owner: Darius Moezzi and Marissa Huxford, Flagstaff, Arizona
Property Owner: Kirsten Family Trust, Flagstaff, Arizona
County Supervisor District: 1 (Art Babbott)

STAFF: Mr. Schwartz gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report. Commissioner Best asked about an additional egress to the North. Mr. Schwartz stated the requirement for an additional egress was for 30 lots or more. There is a forest service easement of a pipeline road that could be used in an emergency. Is the easement held in perpetuity and who would hold it? Mr. Schwartz said staff recommends that it is recorded on the deed as a no build area.

APPLICANT: Craig Steele, 101 E Moonrise Valley, Flagstaff, had read the staff report and agreed with the conditions. The deer and elks' migration path is in the undisturbed meadow and part of the escarpment. He hopes to maintain that for the wildlife. He reviewed the different areas of the map, their uses and what he hopes the future hold for the properties. The fire district has taxing authority and provides protection.

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

DISCUSSION: NA

COMMISSION: All Commissioners could make the findings.

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made a motion to recommend approval to the Board of Supervisors.

SECOND: Commissioner Burton seconded.

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

2. Case No. ZC-20-015: A request for a Zone Change from G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone and RS-18,000 (Residential Single Family, 18,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone to RS-10,000 (Residential Single Family, 10,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone for a .23-acre portion of a 1.94-acre parcel and AR (Agricultural Residential, 1-acre minimum parcels size) Zone for the remaining 1.71 acre portion of the parcel. The subject property is located at 3412 Tonalea Trail in Kachina Village and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 116-20-023A.

Property Owner: Murnane Family Living Trust DTD 4-21-11, Flagstaff, Arizona

Applicant: Matthew Peace, Flagstaff, Arizona
County Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

APPLICANT: Brandon Richards, 753 Comanche St., Flagstaff, had read the staff report and agreed with the Conditions. He planned to build a spec house on the property.

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

COMMISSION: All Commissioners could make the findings.

DISCUSSION: NA

MOTION: Commissioner Clifford made a motion to recommend approval to the Board of Supervisors.

SECOND: Commissioner Burton seconded.

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

Chair Ontiveros needed clarification on case ZC-19-009 since in the Motion the Commissioner made did not include the change for striking Condition #3.

Aaron Lumpkin, County Attorney noted that they needed a motion and a second to reopen.

MOTION: Commissioner Walters made a Motion to reopen case ZC-19-009.

SECOND: Commissioner Ruggles seconded.

Chair Ontiveros asked if the public had any input. No one from the public spoke.

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made the Motion to recommend approval to the Board of Supervisors for case ZC-19-009 with the modification of striking Condition #3.

SECOND: Commissioner Walters seconded.

VOTE: The vote passed unanimously.

3. Case No. CUP-20-058: A request for a Conditional Use Permit renewal (of CUP-08-017) with modifications for a utility facility on a 12.27-acre parcel in the IH-6,000 (Industrial Heavy, 6,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 13501 Townsend-Winona Road in Winona and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 303-05-009.

Property Owner: Woodrow and Candace McNabb, Hobbs, New Mexico

Applicant: Targa Resources, Houston, Texas

Representative: Michael Grace, Dallas, Texas

County Supervisor District: 4 (Jim Parks)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

APPLICANT: Michael Grace, 811 Louisiana St., Houston, TX, had read the staff report and agreed with the Conditions.

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

COMMISSION: All Commissioners could make the findings.

MOTION: Commissioner Clifford made a motion to approve CUP-20-058.

SECOND: Commissioner Ruggles seconded.

DISCUSSION: NA

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

4. Case No. CUP-20-059: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for agritourism and a campground on two parcels totaling 160-acres in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 6929 E Rosilda Springs Road, approximately nine miles southeast of the Parks interchange on Interstate-40 and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Numbers 204-12-007A and 009A.
Property Owner: Bradbarrie Companies LLC, Stephenville, Texas
Applicant: Jeremy Budge, Sandy, Utah
County Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

STAFF: Mr. Schwartz gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report. Commissioner Walters suggested to put water around the border of the property so the animals would not have to interface with humans. Mr. Schwartz showed several water tanks for animals around the property.

Jessica Simmons asked Commissioner Walters about his concerns with the wildlife. He stated wildlife would do anything to get to water and providing other sources could be helpful. Commissioner Walters thought a drinker in the NW corner and another drinker in the SW corner would be beneficial.

Chair Ontiveros asked if wildlife would "readapt" to a different water source. Ms. Simmons thought they would adapt.

APPLICANT: Jeremy Budge, 1835 Sunshine Trail, St. George, UT, had read the staff report and agreed with most of the Conditions, but wanted to discuss a few of them. He agreed with the drinkers and wanted to work with Ms. Simmons on placement. Condition #10 specified a 20 ft wide road, and wanted some lee-way, stating fire code is 12' wide one-way road. On Condition #12, Mr. Budge wanted to discuss a longer renewal than 5 years.

Chair Ontiveros stated after the 5 years he could renewal administratively. Mr. Budge preferred an indefinite permit term, due to the investment.

Mr. Schwartz commented on Condition #10, stating that the road/driveway could go to 12' but possibly have the Condition state as approved by Engineering. The 5-year renewal is used to make sure Conditions are being met, but the Commission could choose the term. He reiterated that the Administrative Renewal is very simple and could be renewed once the permit expires.

Mr. McNeely stated on Condition #10 since this is an internal driveway, nothing governs the width, as long as Engineering and the Fire/Emergency service agrees with the proposed width. The G Zone campgrounds typically (in the past) all have been given 5-year renewal term so staff could follow-up to determine if Conditions are being met.

Chair Ontiveros asked Mr. Schwartz to modify Condition # 10.

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

COMMISSION: Commissioner Clifford thought Condition #10 would be up to Engineering. The expiration should not go past 10 years and then it could renew administratively. The 2 drinkers should be added as approved by Ms. Simmons. Commissioner Walters thought that Condition #10 should be up to Engineering. Renewal should be five years for checks and balances but would consider a ten-year renewal.

Commissioner Burton agreed with the other Commissioners, thinking 5 years is too short, while 10 years would be better.

Commissioner Best had visited the site and thought the applicant's aspirations were in the right place.

Commissioner Best proposed ideas:

Condition #5-add *a noxious weed program*

Condition #11 -add *The Applicant shall provide a Leave No Trace Education Program and a Forest Ecology Program.*

Condition # 12- add *expires 1.6.2031*

Condition #14- add *no rentals of motorized vehicles.*

Condition #15- add *Applicant will provide water sources for wildlife on the NE and SE corners of the property as approved by staff*

Commission Ruggles concurred with everything and thought the renewal period should be 10 years.

Condition #6-add *additionally all outdoor lighting shall be narrow spectrum, filtered, or phosphor-converted amber LED and fully shielded*

Chair Ontiveros agreed with all the amended Conditions and term.

MOTION: Commissioner Best made a motion to approve CUP-20-059 with the Conditions as modified.

SECOND: Commissioner Ruggles seconded.

DISCUSSION: NA

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

5. Case No. CUP-20-062: A request for a Conditional Use Permit modification (of CUP-20-015) for a sign waiver to allow an additional sign at a convenience market with fuel islands on a 1.90-acre parcel in the PC (Planned Community) Zone where CG-10,000 (Commercial General, 10,000 sq. ft minimum parcel size) zoning standards apply. The subject property is located at 101 West Glen in Greentown and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 601-44-024.

Property Owner: Greentown Holdings, LLC, Beaver, Utah

Applicant: Twin Rocks Enterprises, LLC, Littlefield, Arizona

Representative: Bruce Anderson, Mesquite, Nevada

County Supervisor District: 5 (Lena Fowler)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

Commissioner Best asked Mr. Short if he had asked the applicant if he would take down the sign. The applicant did not want to remove the sign that was out of compliance because it was the better option for the business, as it is more visible.

Mr. Short did mention that the original applicant is no longer with the business. It would have been easier to ask for this sign in the original approval of the CUP.

APPLICANT: Bruce Anderson, Mesquite, Nevada, was not present.

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

COMMISSION: Commissioner Clifford had visited the site and made pictures.

The sign on the ground could not be seen at all and blends in with the background, but you could see the free-standing sign.

Commissioner Walters and Burton agreed with Commissioner Clifford.

Commissioner Best and Ruggles thought a continuance would be in order, as the applicant was not present, and wanted to hear from him for fairness.

There was discussion regarding the signs as the Commissioners wanted to set a precedence about signage.

Commissioner Walters thought a continuance was not necessary as this was in the Commissions prevue to come to a decision.

MOTION: Commissioner Best made a motion to approve CUP-20-062 with the modification of Condition #3.

SECOND: Commissioner Clifford seconded.

DISCUSSION: NA

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

IV. CALL TO PUBLIC FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

No one from the public spoke.

Chair Ontiveros adjourned the hearing at 8:16 pm.

V. CONTINUATION OF STUDY SESSION IF NEEDED



Chairperson, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission

ATTEST:



Secretary, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission