

**Coconino County Planning and Zoning Commission  
Meeting of February 24, 2021  
Board of Supervisors' Meeting Room  
County Administrative Center  
219 East Cherry  
Flagstaff, Arizona**

**Members Present**

Don Walters – Vice-Chair  
Sat Best  
John Ruggles  
Tyanna Burton  
Jim Clifford  
Mary Williams

**Members Absent**

Tammy Ontiveros-Chair

**Staff Present**

Jason Christelman, Director  
Jess McNeely, Assistant Director  
Bob Short, Principal. Planner  
Zach Schwartz, Sr. Planner  
Melissa Shaw, Planner  
Aaron Lumpkin, County Attorney  
Marty Hernandez, Recording Secretary

Vice-Chair Walters called the meeting to order at 5:30PM. He noted procedures to the audience.

**I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

January 6, 2021  
January 27, 2021

**MOTION:** Commissioner Ruggles made the motion to approve the minutes from January 6, 2021.

**SECOND:** Commissioner Clifford seconded.

**DISCUSSION:** N/A

**VOTE:** The vote was unanimous.

Commissioner Ruggles had a correction on page 9 of commission packet, Condition #6 for case CUP-20-059, to insert the word “*amber*” after phosphor converted.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Ruggles made the motion to approve the minutes from

January 27, 2021 with the amendment made.  
**SECOND:** Commissioner Williams seconded.  
**DISCUSSION:** N/A  
**VOTE:** The vote was unanimous.

### **III. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- 1- Case No. CUP-20-060: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a campground on a 43.7 parcel in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 5859 N Pleasant View Drive in Woodland Ranch approximately six miles north of Valle and three miles northeast of N State Route 64 and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 502-25-024.  
Property Owner: Jeremy and Rene Giovando, Fort Collins, Colorado  
Applicant: Kylie Chenn, Wander Camp, Lehi, Utah  
County Supervisor District: 1 (Patrice Horstman)

**STAFF:** Mr. McNeely gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report. Commissioner Ruggles asked about staffing and noise limitations. Mr. McNeely stated the site would be staffed at all times as stated in the staff report and since this is a 43-acre site with no developed surrounding properties, noise should not be a concern.

Commissioner Williams wanted to know what was in the county standards regarding the road and dust control. Mr. McNeely discussed the county standards for a road and how the standards could be achieved for this property. The most common way would be compacted AB. Commissioner Williams thought campers coming in off 64 would create more dust for neighboring properties. Mr. McNeely said Woodlands Ranch Road was an improved road, with not a lot of development.

Commissioner Best thought this seemed like a less developed campground than other structures that were similar to other campgrounds in the past. Mr. McNeely stated in the G zones, the entire development needed to be low density. The design was meant to be a low impact infrastructure and removable later. Commissioner Best asked about noise levels and generators, possibly adding a Condition. He spoke about road use on private property and the opposition from the owner of the roads. Mr. McNeely said newer models of generators are low noise but could add a condition about noise levels.

Commissioner Best spoke of easements and road use on private property. Mr. McNeely stated when the applicant applies for a permit it would be stated they have legal access to the road and/or easement. The burden is placed on the applicant to prove they have legal access to the property.

Aaron Lumpkin, County Attorney, stated with an easement it depends on how it is to be used (language of the easement).

**APPLICANT:** Andrew and Kylie Chenn, 2204 Crestview Dr., Lehi, Utah, had read the staff report and had some questions. The goal was to be low impact to the land. He wanted to review the Conditions as he had questions that needed clarification. He did not plan to do any fencing. Mr. Chenn needed the lighting permit to be explained. Mr.

McNeely stated all outdoor lighting had to have a permit, a lumen limit and be fully shielded. Mr. Chenn did submit documentation for the legal access.

Commissioner Williams asked the Chenns who they thought the main customer base would be. Mr. Chenn thought the campers would be a mixture of tourist that would be coming and going. Mrs. Chenn sees the typical customer stays one night as a stopover. Commissioner Williams asked how customers would know the limits of the property boundaries, so they do not trespass onto other property. Mr. Chenn stated they are implementing "Leave No Trace" and fence borders the state land.

Commissioner Ruggles stated he will suggest wording to the lighting condition to make it more flexible.

Commissioner Burton asked about the portable bathrooms. Will they have solar lighting all night long vs. a generator. Mr. Chenn stated it would be all solar.

Commissioner Clifford had reviewed the 1000-gallon water tanks and placement, along with wastewater system and asked about placement. Mr. Chenn explained the system said they would be placed near the bathrooms and removed in the off season.

**PUBLIC:** Tom Lamonte, 3127 E. Woodland Ranch Rd., was concerned about fire hazards, enough water on the property to handle a fire situation, insurance for liability, help with road maintenance, noise, and trespassing concerns. Mr. McNeely stated the fire concern is addressed in the Zoning Ordinances and the developer must have a fire wise plan. Liability for a fire is not controlled by the county. The roads must be maintained by county standards.

William Goodman, 4850 N Pleasant View Dr, asked if there would be signage to direct guests to the campsite. Headlights at night would be directed into his house. There are 2 natural waterways that pass Woodlands Ranch, would the road improvement impede the waterway? He was concerned about wildlife. He moved here for solitude. Mr. McNeely and Chair Walter understood the concerns. The vast majority of these properties are 40 acres, and the junipers provide natural screenings for privacy..

Lacey Ravencraft, 9168 Red Butte Rd., how do they anticipate filling and emptying the water and septic tanks? How would they manage the firepits?

Commissioner Walters stated Condition #2 covered the firepits and the report covered water.

Eric Barela, 1263 S. Rim Ranch Rd., asked what the impact would be to the wildlife and would there be light pollution. Commissioner Walters stated that the wildlife is always disturbed by people and they tend to be pushed further into the state land. The light pollution is addressed in the Conditions.

Laure Sicklesteel, 4937 S Rim Ranch Rd., no one has addressed concerns with only 2 police in the area. Cooking fires have been addressed as they campers cannot have open fire. Is there any mitigation of quads, motorcycles, and ATVs? Commissioner Walters stated nothing is noted in the packet but would be brought up in the Commissioners' discussion.

Melinda Gantner, 6671 Lasso Loop, was concerned of water usage with the extra people in the Valle area. Traffic on the road was also a concern.

**COMMISSION:** Commissioner Best thought the application is unusual due to the low impact. He had Conditions he wanted to review. His concern was the dry grass, and the

danger it poses. Mr. Chenn stated they had been working with the fire chief and the county standards. He would be open to a vehicle with a water tank to respond quickly. Commissioner Walters said Condition #2 covered defensible space. Mr. Chenn said firepits would have gravel around them. The extra water could be used for fire. Commissioner Best asked about composting toilets. Mr. Chenn was still exploring possibilities of using these.

Commissioner Burton asked if there could be a shield around the pit to help contain sparks. Mr. Chenn stated a grating would be in place.

Commissioner Clifford asked about the food trailer/tent area. Mr. Chenn said that had been removed. Cooking would be centralized and not near tents, also under the watch of staff. Commissioner Clifford asked about ATVs. Mr. Chenn stated there would not any rentals, tours, or ATV usage on the property. Commissioner Clifford asked about signage. Mrs. Chenn said signage would be at the start of the property and any other signs that the county requires. Directions would be provided to guests beforehand. Commissioner Clifford asked about fencing and highly recommend that the whole property be fenced, as people are curious and tend to go beyond the boundaries. Commissioner Ruggles did not have questions and agreed with the concerns of the other Commissioners. He thought a sound level requirement should be included in the Conditions. Condition #8 would be adjusted to reflect lighting requirements.

Commissioner Williams had most of her questions asked and answered. She was concerned about directions to the property. She had put it in Google Maps, and it did not take her directly to the property. Mr. Chenn stated the directions would be provided along with GPS information.

Commissioner Best had the Conditions ready:

Condition #2 *"The facility shall be staffed at all times by personnel trained and equipped to extinguish fires as approved by the fire chief."*

Condition #4 after property add *"including a dust mitigation plan approved by staff."*

Condition # 6 *"The property shall be fenced with wildlife friendly fencing and signed to prohibit crossing on to state or private land."*

Condition #10-after materials add *"applicant shall provide all guests with leave no trace educational materials (see the Center for Outdoor Ethics)."*

Condition #13 *"There shall be no motorized vehicles rentals, except for bicycles."*

Condition #14 *"Noise at the property line shall not exceed 50 dBa."*

Commissioner Burton thought it was best not to put a burden on the applicant to require fencing but use markers as this is not an open range.

Commissioner Ruggles adjusted the lighting condition.

Condition #8 *"All outdoor lighting shall be fully shield narrow spectrum LED to the greatest extent possible. All Class 2 lighting less than 2500 lumens shall be amber LED to the greatest extent possible. When the preceding requirements cannot be met, outdoor lighting shall not exceed 2700K CCT. A lighting permit shall be approved prior to the installation of any outdoor lighting."*

**MOTION:** Commissioner Burton made a motion to approve CUP-20-060 with the Conditions as modified.

**SECOND:** Commissioner Best seconded.

**DISCUSSION:** NA

**VOTE:** The vote was unanimous.

- 2- Case No. CUP-20-071: A request for a Conditional Use Permit to use a recreational vehicle (RV) as a permanent residence on a 1.03-acre parcel in the AR (Agricultural Residential, one-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 1654 E Vernon Road in Valle and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 501-19-077.  
Property Owner/Applicant: Matthew Burke, Mesa, Arizona  
County Supervisor District: 1 (Patrice Horstman)

**STAFF:** Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

**APPLICANT:** Matthew Burke, 1654 E Burden Rd., Mesa, AZ, agreed with the staff report and conditions. He decided to use an eco-friendly composting toilet and would be able to get his own water.

**PUBLIC:** No one from the public spoke.

**COMMISSION:** All Commissioner could make the findings to approve.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Clifford made a motion to approve CUP-20-071.

**SECOND:** Commissioner Ruggles seconded.

**DISCUSSION:** NA

**VOTE:** The vote was unanimous.

- 3- Case No. ZC-20-017: A request for a Zone Change from G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to the RC (Resort Commercial) Zone with approval of a master development plan for the development of a resort including 151 recreational vehicle (RV) spaces for long term lease and 147 cabins for fee simple sales on a 61.98-acre parcel. The property is located south of the Newman Park Exit on the east side of I-17 between Kachina Village and Munds Park and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 400-13-001.  
Property Owner: RNM Ranches LLC, Gilbert, Arizona  
Applicant: Bruce Lutz, Kalispell, Montana  
County Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

**STAFF:** Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

Commissioner Williams asked if the cabin leases were a four season use. Mr. Short deferred to the applicant.

Commissioner Clifford asked if FS 772 would be paved to the forest service boundary. Mr. Short referred to the map and it appeared to be paved the length.

Commissioner Best thought getting rid of the billboards would be nice. He wondered if more plantings would soften the look.

**APPLICANT:** Bruce Lutz, 431 First Ave. East, Kalispell, MT, stated this is a long-term ownership program. Sean Murphy from the FS had met with the group for this project and the OHV issue was discussed. An informational kiosk will be installed. A forest thinning project will be around this site which enhances fire safety. They discussed the trails to the forest and their impact and use. He concurred with the Conditions and agreed with the staff report.

Commissioner Best wanted more information on landscaping.

Mr. Lutz stated this is an all-seasons resort. The paving on the access road will be from the interchange to the south boundary. The plan would be to buffer with landscaping and to make the casita and garages aesthetically pleasing. The intent is to have pride of ownership.

Commissioner Burton stated there needs to be something in the Conditions stating guidelines of appearances of the RVs, physical appearance, and covers for RVs. She was concerned since this is a gateway to Flagstaff. Mr. Lutz stated they would cover that in their covenances. They will have architectural guidelines.

Commissioner Clifford had no questions.

Commissioner Ruggles asked about the ground leases, cabins, storage, lighting, and conditions around the area. Mr. Lutz stated these would be covered in the covenances and architectural standards as well.

Commissioner Williams wanted to make sure the cabins would be insulated for year-round use.

Commissioner Walters stated the Foxboro Estates used the ponds as part of a berm to help block noise from the interstate. The ponds used sterile fish in-case they washed out to Oak Creek. He asked if they had considered supplement water for the wildlife. Mr. Lutz thought that was a good idea to provide troughs. Commissioner Walters stated the Foxboro residents could not sublease the property for anything less than 6 months as a suggestion for ownership and subleasing.

**PUBLIC:** No one from the public spoke.

**COMMISSION:** Commissioner Williams liked the plan for this property.

Commissioner Ruggles proposed a modification to the lighting in condition #2 and would prepare the wording.

Commissioner Clifford thought it would be a good project.

Commissioner Burton wanted to add to Condition #14 *"All RVs and RV coverings on-site will maintain an aesthetically pleasing appearance free of any damage or fading."*

Commissioner Best was concerned about offsite impacts but keeps learning from the cases. He modified Condition #11 *"Each RV and cabin site will be provided with "leave no trace" materials (see the Center for Outdoor Ethics) to encourage guests to not leave trash in the forest, be respectful of others in the forest, and be respectful of the natural environment, including the animals and vegetation."*

Condition #15 *"There shall be no motorized vehicle rentals except for bicycles."*

Commissioner Burton added to Condition #11 *"...all RVs and RV coverings on site will maintain an aesthetically pleasing appearance free of any damage and fading."*

Commissioner Ruggles modified Condition #2 *"All outdoor lighting shall be fully-shielded, narrow spectrum amber LED to the greatest extent possible. All Class 2 lighting less than 2500 lumens shall be Amber LED to the greatest extent possible. When the preceding requirements cannot be met, outdoor lighting shall not exceed 2700K CCT. A lighting permit shall be approved prior to installation of any outdoor lighting."*

Commissioner Walters modified Condition #5 *"Provide two water locations on the east side of the property accessible to all wildlife. Escape ramps shall be provided so small animals can escape the water tanks."*

Commissioner Walter asked Jessica Simmons about using the sterile fish. Ms. Simmons said their water feature should be out of the flood plain and not be a concern.

Mr. Lutz wanted to clarify the term “guest” as they are more permanent residents in Conditions #11. From that discussion, Condition #11 was also changed to RV and home sites.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Burton made a motion to recommend approval to the BOS for ZC-20-017.

**SECOND:** Commissioner Ruggles seconded

**DISCUSSION:** NA


**VOTE:** The vote was unanimous.

#### **IV. CALL TO PUBLIC FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA**


No one from the public spoke.

Vice-Chair Walters adjourned the hearing at 8:43 pm.

#### **V. CONTINUATION OF STUDY SESSION IF NEEDED**

  
Chairperson, Coconino County  
Planning and Zoning Commission

**ATTEST:**

  
Secretary, Coconino County  
Planning and Zoning Commission