



OFFICE OF THE COCONINO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

**SPECIAL SESSION, EXECUTIVE SESSION
AND REGULAR SESSION MINUTES**

April 11, 2023

3:30 p.m. – Special Session and Executive Session

*(Consent business items
were conducted during Special Session)*

6:00 p.m. – Regular Session

(Public Hearings)

Present: Chair Patrice Horstman, Vice Chair Jeronimo Vasquez, Supervisor Judy Begay, Supervisor Matt Ryan and Supervisor Lena Fowler were present virtually via Zoom meeting technology.

Also Present: County Manager Steve Peru, Deputy County Manager Sue Brown, Deputy County Manager Andy Bertelsen, Deputy County Attorney Monique Coady, Deputy County Attorney Heather Mosher, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors Lindsay Daley and Deputy Clerk of the Board Valerie Webber were present virtually via Zoom meeting technology.

Chair Horstman called the Special Session to order at 3:33 p.m. and led the pledge of allegiance.

Call to the Public:

Clerk Daley provided instructions to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically. She noted there was no one who indicated they would like to provide public comment.

Proclamation:

1. Consideration and possible action to approve a proclamation designating April 2023 as Earth Month. **County Manager**

Sustainability Manager Amanda Acheson spoke about the importance of sustainability and explained that the County's Sustainable Building Program was created twenty years ago and was one of the first in the country, it serves as a model and resource for others. She provided an overview of upcoming birthday events to be held in celebration of sustainability and introduced Workforce Development Administrative Specialist Yanzi Liu and Assessor's Office Commercial Appraiser Marco Alatorre, who will be reading the proclamation and, recognized all the members of the Green Team.

Public Affairs Administrative Specialist Yanzi Liu and Assessor's Office Commercial Appraiser Marco Alatorre read the proclamation into the record.

Chair Horstman asked for a motion to approve a proclamation designating April 2023 as Earth Month.

Motion: So moved, **Action:** approve, **Moved by:** Supervisor Jeronimo Vasquez, **Seconded by:** Supervisor Matt Ryan. The motion passed unanimously.

Individual Board members expressed their appreciation of members of the Green Team and thanked them for their leadership in sustainability. They spoke about the importance of everyone doing their part to protect and preserve the earth.

Marco Alatorre said he echo's Supervisor Fowlers words and introduced his son, noting he will still be alive at the end of the century and everyone needs to do more to make sure the Earth is still livable when his son is older.

Board of Supervisors Consent Agenda:

Chair Horstman requested to remove item 5 from the consent agenda and asked if there were any other items the Board would like to remove.

Seeing none, Chair Horstman requested a motion to approve the consent agenda items 2 through 12, and removing item 5.

Motion: Move to approve items 2 through 12, with the exception of item 5, **Action:** approve, **Moved by:** Supervisor Matt Ryan, **Seconded by:** Supervisor Lena Fowler. The motion passed unanimously.

2. Consideration and possible action to approve the minutes from the Board of Supervisors meeting conducted March 28, 2023.
3. Consideration and possible action to ratify and/or approve warrants, electronic fund transfers, and other payments as listed on the agenda. An itemized list of the below-numbered claims is filed in the official records of the Coconino County Board of Supervisors.

Run Date	Warrant Numbers	Computer Register Totals
03/30/2023	EFT – 19144 – 19211	\$341,262.22
03/30/2023	Checks – 93203842 – 93203932	\$148,431.17

4. Consideration and possible action to approve a budget amendment from District 4 Community Initiatives account, in the amount of \$8,000.00, to Travel and Operations account for Fiscal Year 2023 current and upcoming expenses. **Board of Supervisors**
5. **Removed:** Consideration and possible action to appoint Sheila Walsh to the Planning and Zoning Commission from District 4, with a 4-year term set to expire June 30th, 2027. **Community Development**

Supervisor Begay said she would like to introduce Sheila Walsh, who is recommending to be appointed to the Planning and Zoning Commission from District 4, with a 4-year term set to expire June 30th, 2027. She spoke about Ms. Walsh’s work experience and community activism.

Supervisor Begay moved to approve the appointment of Sheila Walsh to the Planning and Zoning Commission.

Chair Horstman noted there is a motion to appoint Sheila Walsh to the Planning and Zoning Commission from District 4, with a 4-year term set to expire June 30th, 2027 and asked if there is a second.

Seconded by Supervisor Lena Fowler.

Chair Horstman called for the question; the motion passed unanimously.

Sheila Walsh thanked the Board said she is a big reader so the nature of her reading will change now. She said it will be an honor to serve on the Planning and Zoning Commission and that she is invested in her neighborhood and should be contributing to the County.

County Manager Steve Peru said it was good to see Sheila again as she used to work for the Health Department. He welcomed her to the Planning and Zoning Commission.

Community Development Director Jay Christelman introduced himself to Ms. Walsh and said he looks forward to seeing her on Monday for her orientation.

6. Consideration and possible action to approve an increase and transfer to the County Attorney’s Office general fund operating budget in the amount of \$187,640 for FY23 operational expenditures, and approve expenditure authority and corresponding budget amendment. **County Attorney**
7. Consideration and possible action to appoint Sally Harvey to Precinct 19, Henry Kanner, and Claudia Johnson to Precinct 98 as Democratic Precinct Committee persons, for a term to expire on October 1, 2024, and as requested by the

Coconino County Democratic Party Chair to fill a vacancy created from a lack of candidates during the 2022 election. **Elections**

8. Consideration and possible action to approve the benefit plan renewals and changes for FY24. **Human Resources**
9. Consideration and possible action to approve a sewer line Construction Costs Reimbursement Agreement between the City of Flagstaff and Coconino County, for the Fort Tuthill to University Heights sewer line. **Parks and Recreation**
10. Consideration and possible action to approve the purchase of one (1) 2023 John Deere 410L Backhoe from RDO Equipment Co. using Sourcewell Contract, 032119 JDC for \$179,014.95. This piece of equipment will replace unit number 00263, a 2002 Caterpillar 420D Backhoe which has met the criteria of a minimum of 15 years for replacement. **Public Works**
11. Consideration and possible action to approve the purchase and installation of one 77,000 lb. heavy equipment lift and 6 portable mobile column lifts with accessories in support of the Remodel of B3 (Heavy Maintenance Shop, Public Works) using the Sourcewell cooperative agreement #013020-MRL, in the amount of \$332,916.67. **Public Works**
12. Consideration and possible action to 1) approve an increase the fuel expenditure account and a budget adjustment from Mechanical Services Fund in the amount of \$525,000 in the expense account and 2) approve a budget adjustment in the amount of \$620,000 to the revenue account. **Public Works**

Chair Horstman read the agenda title for item #13 and stated that it is recommended that the Board go into executive session for the item. Deputy County Attorney Monique Coady confirmed that is the recommendation.

Motion: So moved, **Action:** to enter executive session **Moved by:** Supervisor Matt Ryan, **Seconded by:** Supervisor Lena Fowler. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Horstman explained that the Board will take a short break before entering the Teams executive session. She called for a break at 4:17 p.m. to allow time for the Board to conduct executive session.

Executive Session:

13. Discussion and consultation with the Board's attorneys to consider its position and instruct its attorneys regarding Arizona Democratic Party v. No Labels et.al. (including Coconino County Board of Supervisors in their official capacity), Maricopa County Superior Court case # CV2023-004832; pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(3) & (4) the Board may vote to enter executive session for this item. **County Attorney**

Present: Chair Patrice Horstman, Vice Chair Jeronimo Vasquez, Supervisor Lena Fowler, Supervisor Matt Ryan and Supervisor Judy Begay were present via Teams virtual software.

Also Present: County Manager Steve Peru, Deputy County Manager Sue Brown, Deputy County Manager Andy Bertelsen, Deputy County Attorney Monique Coady, Deputy County Attorney Heather Mosher and Clerk of the Board of Supervisors Lindsay Daley were present via Teams virtual software.

Chair Horstman convened executive session at 4:18 p.m.

Chair Horstman adjourned the executive session at 4:40 p.m.

Chair Horstman reconvened open session at 4:43 p.m.

Discussion Items:

14. Discussion and update regarding state and/or federal legislative and/or administrative matters. **County Manager**

Government Affairs Manager Greg Nelson briefly updated the Board on the status of the state legislative session, budget negotiations and state legislation and federal legislation.

15. Discussion, review and possible direction regarding the Board of Supervisors planning calendar. **County Manager**

The Board did not address this item.

16. Discussion and update from the County Manager regarding possible community, regional and/or administrative matters. **County Manager**

County Manager Peru stated there is a lot of snow melt happening and Public Works, Sheriff's Office and Emergency Management and many others are responding associated calls. Staff is wrapping up budget planning and planning on the County Supervisor's Association Summit in October. He announced that a Communications Director recruitment will be forthcoming and thanked staff for all their help stepping in to help.

17. Roundtable: To be discussed. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02(H), these matters will not be acted upon: Reports from Supervisors; updates on new projects, district budgets, requests for services and initiatives, updates from county staff:
 - District 2 – Supervisor Jeronimo Vasquez
 - District 3 – Supervisor Matt Ryan
 - District 4 – Supervisor Judy Begay
 - District 5 – Supervisor Lena Fowler
 - District 1 – Supervisor Patrice Horstman
 - Chair's Report

Individual Board members provided a brief update on current events, projects and meetings they've attended relative to their respective districts and committee appointments.

There being no further discussion, Chair Horstman adjourned the Special Session portion of the meeting at 5:06 p.m.

6:00 p.m. – Regular Session

Present: Chair Patrice Horstman, Vice Chair Jeronimo Vasquez, Supervisor Matt Ryan and Supervisor Lena Fowler were present virtually via Zoom meeting technology. Supervisor Judy Begay was present telephonically.

Also Present: County Manager Steve Peru, Deputy County Manager Sue Brown, Deputy County Manager Andy Bertelsen, Deputy County Attorney Monique Coady, Deputy County Attorney Heather Mosher, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors Lindsay Daley and Deputy Clerk of the Board Valerie Webber were present virtually via Zoom meeting technology.

Chair Horstman called the Regular Session portion of the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m.

Public Hearings:

18. Public Hearing, presentation, consideration and possible action to adopt proposed Coconino County Fair Fees for FY 24 and FY25. **Parks and Recreation**

Parks and Recreation Director Cynthia Nemeth outlined the purpose and information to be provided by Parks and Recreation Fair Manager and Program Coordinator Ricky Conway.

Fair Manager Ricky Conway presented a powerpoint that provided background on current fair admission fees, County Fair data on attendance, which included livestock entries, non-livestock entries and vendors between 2019 and 2022. He highlighted revenue streams between 2019 and 2022, Fair expense categories, expense trends, the uses of fund balance, comparisons to other Arizona Fairs and Flagstaff events, and staff's proposed fee changes. He further reviewed Fiscal Year 2023, 2024 and 2025 projected Fair admission fee revenue and estimated financial impacts, benefits of fee changes, the public process used for public outreach and the next steps in moving forward.

Chair Horstman opened the public hearing to receive public comment at 6:26 p.m.

Clerk Daley provided instructions to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically. She noted there was no one who indicated they would like to provide public comment.

Chair Horstman noted for the record County Manager Peru received an email from Heather with Mountain Line as follows:

Good Morning County Manager Peru,

I am reaching out regarding Coconino County's proposed County Fair fee changes. As you know, Mountain Line has provided transportation to the fairgrounds from NAU (and recently from the east side as well) for many years, giving Fair attendees the opportunity to save the \$5 parking fee. The proposed changes include the elimination of that \$5 fee, making parking free of charge. We understand the rationale behind this proposal, as collecting that fee often creates traffic issues. When barriers to parking are removed, as we saw during the removal of paid parking downtown during COVID, there are often unintended consequences. I'd like to offer an idea that might help keep the parking demand lower and continue achieving the County's sustainability goals. Have you considered continuing to incentivize fair-goers who do not drive personal vehicles to the event? Perhaps offering a coupon to those who ride the bus for either a discount on admission or to be used toward food, rides, or game play at the fair? Our goal is to not lose the momentum we've built over the years in changing habits and getting people to use transit for this event.

We would be happy to make this as an official public comment as part of the process, but I wanted to check in with you first to see if any conversations had been had about the transit service. Thank you for your consideration and please feel free to reach out if you'd like to discuss further.

*Heather Dalmolin
CEO and General Manager
Mountain Line*

Chair Horstman closed the public hearing at 6:28 p.m.

Supervisor Ryan said he felt there is a need for a full scoping of parking fees. He noted that when the County did the Master Plan, there were so many special interests that they had to try to direct it more towards the public. There hasn't been a real analysis of opportunities and there needs to be a broader scope of events. He spoke about difficulties associated with parking fees and parking issues and the need to be able to carry the impacts associated with the activity; there needs to be an analysis not only of the fair but other events and options available.

Chair Horstman said she agrees with a lot of what supervisor Ryan said and thanked staff for the work they do for the communities. She said she is convinced of the need to do a slight increase for Fair fees as it is totally in line with other Fairs and to be expected with the associated costs to run the Fair. She said she is concerned with waiving the parking fees as once you do away with it, it is hard to bring back and also, it does bring the wrong message to the public.

Supervisor Fowler thanked staff for all their work and said she wondered why there were no public comments. She said the fee increase is reasonable, but she agrees that it is too soon to make a decision at this time regarding the proposed change to parking fees.

Vice Chair Vasquez thanked staff for the presentation and their hard work. He said he is fine with the fee increase and likes the idea of providing free parking as it would allow more money for the citizens to spend in the fair. He does hear the members' concerns about doing away with the fees and would like to hear other ideas to incorporate.

Supervisor Begay said she appreciates all the hard work staff has put into this effort. She agrees with a fair admission fee increase. One area to be considered is the Veteran portion of their fee at a less amount, because they protected us. As far as the parking fees something needs to be done, with the improvements that we need to do to bring the fairground conditions and facilities up, the parking fees should not be taken out as it would be hard to get back. She agrees with the other Board members.

Supervisor Ryan said there is consistency on the parking fee but it might make sense to allow time for staff to explore alternatives and bring suggestions regarding parking fees back to the Board at a future time and go forward with the other recommended fees.

Upon inquiry from Chair Horstman, County Manager Peru said he believes that the item is posted for Fair fees, the Board can adopt the Fair admission fee increase, separate parking fees and bring them back for reconsideration.

Chair Horstman stated she understands the Board can do that and asked if that requires another public hearing.

Deputy County Attorney said no, the statutes would not require another hearing, the Board would simply vote on the admission fees today but not the parking fees and then the parking fees could be placed on a future agenda but it would not require putting it on the agenda because they're not being done by ordinance like other items where we've had to post.

Chair Horstman asked "So the Board could continue that to a later date and for further review?"

Deputy County Attorney Coady affirmed "That is correct."

Deputy County Manager Andy Bertelsen asked if the Board does not move forward with parking fees this evening, would the parking fees remain as they currently exist going forward and then at a later date bring them back after they are revisited.

Chair Horstman said that is an option, they would stay as is. She noted some of this is not what the Board needs to make a decision on. For example, the Board could ask Parks and Recreation to determine and then say that they cannot have all this money on site and then run around and have many banks all over to do parking, and that they are going to only allow credit cards.

County Manager Peru affirmed those are details staff will work on, cash handling in terms of control, as there are a lot of pieces to the fair experience. Staff will revisit parking fees and come back with some analysis and options.

Chair Horstman said she would like to see an incentive program, it can be incentivized to say something like if you have four people in your car you may get say \$2.00 off the fee.

Upon inquiry from Chair Horstman, the Board discussed bringing parking fees back for future consideration.

Supervisor Begay said she is okay with the fees as proposed by staff at this time accept she would like the Board to consider acting on reducing the fee for Veterans, bring it back to a \$5 admission fee.

There was a discussion among the Board and staff regarding a reduced admission fee for Veterans from \$7.00 down to \$5.00, including its reduction to projected revenue.

Motion: Move to approve the admissions fees as recommended with the exception of the Military Veterans fee, changing that to \$5.00, and removing parking to be brought back at a future date, **Moved by:** Supervisor Matt Ryan.

Chair Horstman asked for clarification from Supervisor Ryan's motion. She asked "Does that mean parking stays the same for right now and will be brought back for a future date?"

Supervisor Ryan said "It's kind of intuitive, parking is there until they modify it and that's what we have before us, a potential modification."

Chair Horstman asked for a second to the motion.

Seconded by: Supervisor Judy Begay.

Chair Horstman said we have a second, all those in favor of the proposed fair admission fees as presented, reducing military, active military Veterans however to a \$5.00 fee and withholding any action on parking until a later date, so the parking would remain in affect at the current time?

Supervisor Fowler said "Madam Chair you just said active military, so are we talking military or active military?"

Chair Horstman said "Military or Veterans."

Supervisor Ryan said "Correct, that was my motion."

Chair Horstman called for the question; the motion passed unanimously.

19. Public Hearing, consideration and possible action to adopt Ordinance 2023-05, approving a zone change from the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to the CG-10,000 (Commercial General) on the eastern half a 6.1-acre portion of a 9.17-acre parcel; the property is located at 28272 N US Highway 89

and is further identified as parcel number 302-02-002; the applicant Shelley Smithson of Flagstaff, AZ. **Community Development**

Chair Horstman read the agenda title into the record and noted most of us recognize this property as old Antelope Hills. She described the process that will take place to conduct the public hearing.

Community Development Director Jay Christelman presented a powerpoint that described the location of the property and details of the request for the Grand Canyon Oasis Zone Change (ZC-22-021). He displayed vicinity and aerial maps, photos of the property and a zoning map of the development and described the citizen participation meeting results. He further explained the findings of fact that need to be made for approval of the request and staff recommended conditions to be adopted with any approval.

Chair Horstman opened the public hearing to receive public comment at 7:25 p.m.

Clerk Daley provided instructions to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically.

Clerk Daley noted the applicant, Shelley Smithson has her hand raised.

Chair Horstman apologized she didn't refer to the applicant before opening the public hearing.

Shelley Smithson thanked the Board for the opportunity to speak and said she was present with her fiancé, Adam Cook, who is also a partner in the business. She said they are a local family business that lives in Kachina, having bought their property two years ago and have been bringing it up to its former glory. It was a really nice property at one point but had fallen into disrepair. They can see the progress they are making and look forward to continuing to grow the project and bring more people in to show them their beautiful area.

Adam Cook said they love the intimate feel. He is a Northern Arizona University graduate with a Parks and Recreation degree and a Geology minor, a guide manager and he went to Grand Canyon hiking seminars and Grand Canyon Association, so they have a lot of feel for the outdoors. They want to keep it an intimate, open nature experience and not at all a corporate park where you can get in as many people as you can. They want to promote the outdoors and the proper use of the outdoors.

Chair Horstman said she likes their idea of having a stable for horses, there are a lot of horse trailer travelers through that part of 89.

Upon inquiry from Supervisor Ryan, Applicant Shelley Smithson affirmed she understands the conditions that will be required as part of the approval.

Upon inquiry from Chair Horstman, Clerk Daley provided instructions again to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their

computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically. She noted there were no hands raised from members of the public. She advised there are no hands raised from members of the public who wish to speak.

Chair Horstman closed the public hearing at 7:30 p.m.

Chair Horstman noted she has not received any written comment on this proposal. Upon inquiry, Clerk Daley, Director Christelman and Vice Chair Vasquez affirmed they have not received any comments.

Supervisor Ryan said this is a fantastic proposal and would bring the property in compliance and is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. He said it meets the fire conditions and he can make the findings of fact associated with the proposal. This is a tremendous improvement, the applicant is addressing safety issues and it is compatible with the neighborhood.

Vice Chair Vasquez reiterated what Supervisor Ryan said, adding that this is a project that will renovate and not oversaturate the property with Recreational Vehicles.

Supervisor Begay agreed and said she supports the project, it is good for the community.

Supervisor Fowler said she is excited about the project and is glad to know what the plan is. It is good to bring life back to Highway 89. She said she can make all the findings of fact for approval of this project.

Chair Horstman said is wonderful to see renovation of this site and it is an exciting proposal by a family-owned business and will greatly enhance the area and provide much needed housing. She said she can make the three findings of fact and agrees that it will not adversely affect the surrounding neighborhood but will enhance the neighborhood.

Motion: Approve Ordinance 2023-05, approving a zone change from the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to the CG-10,000 (Commercial General) for parcel number 302-02-002, a 6.1-acre portion of a 9.17-acre parcel on North US Highway 89, **Action:** approve, **Moved by:** Supervisor Jeronimo Vasquez, **Seconded by:** Supervisor Judy Begay.

Chair Horstman called for the question.

Supervisor Fowler said “Madam Chair, it looks like Jay has his hand up.”

Director Christelman said he’d like to add on behalf of the applicant that some of the spots that they currently are utilizing, are actually being rented long-term for employees that are working on the Navajo Nation.

Chair Horstman said she’s glad he brought it up since that’s even more reason for this, since housing in this area is certainly at a premium.

Chair Horstman called for the question; the motion passed unanimously.

20. Public Hearing, consideration and possible adoption of Ordinance 2023-06, approving a Zone Change from the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to the MHP (Manufactured Home Park) Zone for the development of a 62-space manufactured home park and a fire station on a 40.28 acre parcel in the Valle area; on State Route 64 in Valle approximately ½ mile from the intersection of US Highway 180 and State Route 64 and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 503-34-006A; the applicant is Ryan Scott of Aspire Fund LLC, Gilbert, Arizona. **Community Development**

Assistant Director McNeely presented a powerpoint that described the location of the property and details of the request for the Grand Canyon Tiny Home Village Zone Change (ZC-23-001). He displayed vicinity and aerial maps, photos of the property, a zoning map of the development and described the citizen participation meeting results. He further explained the findings of fact that need to be made for approval of the request and Planning and Zoning Commission's recommendation of approval with listed conditions.

Upon inquiry from Vice Chair Vasquez, Assistant Director McNeely answered questions related to short term rentals and conformity with the draft Short Term Rental Ordinance.

Applicant Ryan Scott of Aspire Fund LLC said he has been doing a lot of research on this kind of offering for a long time, it's very focused on what he wants to bring to the community. He owns property in Kachina and other areas as well and spends a lot of time here and has pride in bringing what's necessary to the area, which is more housing in an attractive way along the highway. The opportunity was to do a much denser project but that is not what he is going for as he is going for a community approach for long-term guests.

Supervisor Ryan said the proposal included a lot of thought and he asked the applicant if he agrees with the proposed conditions. Ryan Scott affirmed he understands and agrees with the proposed conditions.

Chair Horstman opened the public hearing to receive public comment at 8:09 p.m.

Clerk Daley provided instructions to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically.

High County Fire and Rescue Fire Chief Robert Trotter, 6593 High Country Lane, said he wanted to inform the Board that he attended the pre-meetings for this site and contacted Mr. Scott with an idea of possibly putting a fire station on his property, to kind of help that area up in Valle as it doesn't really have any assigned fire districts or fire departments except himself, High Country Fire and Tusayan Fire. Right now he doesn't have any funding for a fire station but has some ideas for funding, it would probably be several years before anything could be presented to the County.

Supervisor Ryan said it is noted in condition 11 that the applicant shall contract through High County Fire.

Upon inquiry from Supervisor Ryan, Fire Chief Trotter affirmed he is aware of the condition.

Upon inquiry from Chair Horstman, Clerk Daley provided instructions to attendees on how to provide comment by clicking on the raise hand icon appearing in the lower portion of their computer screen to speak or by pressing *9 if present telephonically. She advised there are no hands raised from members of the public who wish to speak.

Chair Horstman closed the public hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Chair Horstman stated she is excited about the proposal as this is an area where housing is needed and having a fire station in this area will greatly benefit the people in the community. The proposal is very unique and needed and the tiny house idea provides workforce housing. The Board would like to maintain neighborhoods and short term rentals are an area of concern. She said she agrees with staff's findings and the change is consistent with the goals, objectives and policies of the Comprehensive Plan and this Ordinance, the change will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, comfort, convenience and welfare and, the change will not adversely affect the established character of the surrounding neighborhood nor be detrimental to adjacent properties.

Supervisor Ryan said he can make the findings and noted that this is a particularly well-designed proposal for this area. It reinforces commercial elements but beyond that it brings housing to the community, it's an opportunity. He said he does not see something coming in for a full exploitation but is a well-designed component with the area. There may come a need to address dust factors and although it is a hardship, for the quality of the neighborhood it is something for the applicant to watch.

Supervisor Fowler thanked the applicant for really studying the area and the need for a fire station. This is a well thought out project and provides housing. She said she can make the findings of fact and the project very considerable of the Comprehensive Plan.

Vice Chair Vasquez said this is an exciting project in the sense that it brings workforce housing to the area and anything they can do help with affordable housing in the County, he would like to jump on it. He said he can make the findings of fact to approve the Ordinance.

Supervisor Begay said she is excited about the project and thanked the developer for their work on the project.

Chair Horstman said she would entertain a motion for the adoption of Ordinance 2023-06, approving a Zone Change as set forth in the agenda.

Motion: Approve the adoption of Ordinance 2023-06, approving a Zone Change from G General, 10-acre minimum parcel size Zone to the MHP, which is Manufactured Home Park, Zone for the development of a 62-space manufactured home park and a fire station, which is

actually has to go through a Conditional Use Permit, on a 40.28 acre parcel in the Valle area; on Highway State Route 64, or State Route 64, in Valle approximately ½ mile from the intersection of US Highway 180 and State Route 64 and this is for Assessor's Parcel Number 503-34-006A, **Action:** approve, **Moved by:** Supervisor Matt Ryan, **Seconded by:** Supervisor Lena Fowler. The motion passed unanimously.

There being no further discussion, Chair Horstman adjourned the meeting at 8:28 p.m.

COCONINO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

(SEAL)



Patrice Horstman, Chair

ATTEST:



Lindsay Daley, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

Warrant listing for 3/30/2023 as required by ARS-11-217.D

The minutes shall include all demands and warrants approved by the board in excess of one thousand dollars and multiple demands and warrants from a single supplier or individual under one thousand dollars whose cumulative total exceeds one thousand dollars in a single reporting period.

Check	Vendor	Amount
<u>19145</u>	AMERIGAS PROPANE LP	4,164.16
<u>19147</u>	ARIZONA COUNTIES INSURANCE POOL	1,335.00
<u>19148</u>	JONNA E BAKER	3,704.40
<u>19153</u>	CINDY MAY	1,950.00
<u>19154</u>	CIRCLE OF PAGE	2,519.29
<u>19156</u>	CIVICPLUS, LLC	55,826.86
<u>19159</u>	COCONINO COUNTY	48,147.18
<u>19160</u>	COCONINO COUNTY	58,709.04
<u>19161</u>	COCONINO COUNTY	6,080.43
<u>19162</u>	COCONINO COUNTY	25,163.91
<u>19164</u>	CRM OF AMERICA LLC	2,724.11
<u>19165</u>	ELEVATED ADVOCACY LLC	5,500.00
<u>19169</u>	TYRRELL-MARXEN CHEVROLET CADILLAC INC	9,348.06
<u>19178</u>	THE GUIDANCE CENTER INC	4,068.06
<u>19179</u>	HDS TRUCK DRIVING INSTITUTE INC	35,960.00
<u>19182</u>	JE FULLER HYDROLOGY AND GEOMORPHOLOGY INC	4,017.50
<u>19184</u>	MELISSA A LAGIES	1,817.20
<u>19186</u>	DEBORAHE L BOONE	1,298.24
<u>19194</u>	PEAK ENGINEERING INC	18,900.00
<u>19195</u>	PERFORMANCE STRATEGIES	1,792.43
<u>19198</u>	RED FEATHER DEVELOPMENT GROUP	18,832.13
<u>19200</u>	SHAMROCK FOODS	8,875.40
<u>19201</u>	JENNIFER SULLIVAN	3,498.63
<u>19204</u>	UNITED INFORMATION SERVICES, INC	1,765.24
<u>19205</u>	VANGUARD TRUCK HOLDINGS LLC	1,987.66
<u>19207</u>	AMANDA J WILLEY	1,011.40
<u>19208</u>	WITT O'BRIENS LLC	1,162.50
<u>93203843</u>	ALLIANT GAS LLC	1,358.85
<u>93203845</u>	ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE	1,099.87
<u>93203846</u>	ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE	1,419.99
<u>93203847</u>	ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE	6,333.49
<u>93203850</u>	ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE	10,726.39
<u>93203851</u>	ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE	7,325.23
<u>93203852</u>	ASTA-USA TRANSLATION SERVICES INC	2,380.84
<u>93203853</u>	AXON ENTERPRISE INC	5,545.95
<u>93203863</u>	CITY OF FLAGSTAFF	5,789.99
<u>93203864</u>	CITY OF FLAGSTAFF	8,597.28
<u>93203866</u>	CIVICPLUS, LLC	1,925.49

93203867	COCONINO COUNTY	1,981.58
93203874	DEAN DOCTOR	1,137.00
93203875	EMPIRE SOUTHWEST LLC	8,580.41
93203888	HEINFELD, MEECH & CO, PC	22,000.00
93203891	KIM A KALAS	2,000.00
93203892	KIMBALL MIDWEST	1,764.37
93203893	KINNEY CONSTRUCTION LLC	7,235.00
93203895	LOCAL FIRST ARIZONA FOUNDATION	2,100.00
93203898	MCMASTER CARR SUPPLY COMPANY	1,734.84
93203901	MORNING DEW LANDSCAPING INC	1,888.00
93203903	NATIVE AMERICANS FOR COMMUNITY ACTION INC	12,512.16
93203907	PAGE UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT	4,973.61
93203910	CHRISTOPHER J MARGESON	2,100.00
93203911	CHRISTOPHER J MARGESON	2,350.00
93203920	THOMSON REUTERS-WEST PAYMENT CENTER	3,002.51
93203925	UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA	2,621.30
93203928	CELLCO PARTNERSHIP	1,005.45