

Coconino County Planning and Zoning Commission
Meeting of September 27, 2023
Teams-Web-Based Technology

Members Present

Tammy Ontiveros– Chair
Tyanna Burton – Vice-Chair
Rose Toehe
Mary Williams
Sheila Walsh
Sat Best
John Ruggles

Members Absent

Rob Wilson

Staff Present

Jason Christelman, Director
Jess McNeely-Assistant Director
Bob Short, Principal. Planner
Zach Schwartz, Sr. Planner
Melissa Shaw, Long Range Planner
Kelly Bingham, Planner
Jessica Simmons-Wildlife Planner
Abigail Cook, County Attorney
Rachel Davis, Business Manager
Charlene Slaughter, Recording Secretary

Chair Ontiveros called the meeting to order at 5:30PM. She noted procedures to the audience.

I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION: Commissioner Best made the motion to approve the minutes from August 30, 2023.

SECOND: Commissioner Ruggles seconded.

DISCUSSION: N/A

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

III. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Case No. CUP-21-039: A request for a two-year extension to obtain building permits for an RV park Conditional Use Permit on a 16.7-acre parcel in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located at 13358 E Old Route 66 in Parks near the Parks exit from Interstate-40 and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 203-30-003D.

Property Owner/Applicant: PLM Adventures, LLC (Lisa and Pete Mulgrew)
Chandler, AZ
Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

2. Case No. CUP-23-036: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a recreational vehicle as a permanent residence on a 1-acre parcel in the AR-1 (Agricultural Residential, 1-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 3234 S Spruce Road in Valle and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 501-07-072.
Property Owner/Applicant: Anders Otteson, Pasadena, California
Supervisor District: 1 (Patrice Horstman)
A continuance is requested until October 25, 2023, Commission Meeting.

3. Case No. CUP-23-038: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a recreational vehicle as a permanent residence on a 1.03-acre parcel in the AR-1 (Agricultural Residential, 1-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 1565 E Valle Road in Valle and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 501-14-034.
Property Owner: Isham Group, LLC, Hidden Hills, California
Applicant: Lexington Isham, Hidden Hills, California
Supervisor District: 1 (Patrice Horstman)

Chair Ontiveros noted CUP-21-039, CUP-23-036, CUP-23-038 all have staff recommended approval and are simple CUP requests, similar to others we have had in the past. Chair Ontiveros asked if any of the Commissioners want to discuss any of the three cases or rather approve them together with one motion. Vice-Chair Burton asked if Case No. CUP-23-036 needs to be done separately since it is a continuance, until October 25, 2023, and not a straight up approval. Chair Ontiveros says the information received does have a recommendation for a 30-day approval and all three have staff recommendation. Chair Ontiveros asks for Mr. McNeely to address Vice-Chair Burton's question. Mr. McNeely says item two, Case No. CUP-23-036, has a recommendation from staff and could be taken under one motion to take staff's recommendation that is in the staff report and on agenda. Mr. McNeely says Commission is not approving the item but approving the staff recommendation for a continuance to October 25, 2023, that could go in one motion, as following staff recommendation.

Chair Ontiveros asked if anyone from the public was present and wanted to speak. Since neither Commissioners nor the public had any comments, it was noted all three cases would be approved in one motion with the conditions as reported in the staff report.

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made a motion to approve all cases with the conditions as noted in the staff reports.

SECOND: Commissioner Walsh seconded

DISCUSSION: N/A

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously

4. Case No. CUP-23-010: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a cottage industry to operate a machine shop on a 13.36-acre parcel in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The subject property is located at 8311 E Old Route 66 in Pitman Valley/Parks and is identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 203-18-003D.
Property Owner/Applicant: Eric and Misty Oxborrow, Williams, Arizona
Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and summarized the staff report.

APPLICANT: Eric and Misty Oxborrow, Williams, Arizona. Eric Oxborrow, 8311 East Old Route 66. He received the packet. Had originally told Bob Short the signs were 18x18 but are 10 inches x18 inches. Eric Oxborrow agrees with all the conditions. Does not have a problem with any of them.

PUBLIC: N/A

COMMISSION: Commissioner Best makes the findings. A great use of the cottage industry as part of the zoning ordinance, he sees a lot of opportunities coming out of it, so he can approve. Commissioner Ruggles has no problems with making the condition for approval of the CUP and waivers also. He commends the applicant on the data he had sent regarding the noise levels. Commissioner Ruggles understands this extremely well. The applicant did terrific in giving us more than needed to evaluate. Commissioner Ruggles visited the site with Mr. Bob Short and used his sound system that meets current standards to read the noise levels on-site. Commissioner Ruggles took sound measurements inside the sound shop with one of the applicant's machine shops running. The readings were in the order of 69 to 70 dba, which to Commissioner Ruggles is not particularly noisy. Commissioner Ruggles in speaking to applicant, applicant mentioned he will have his stereo on which bumped it up to 76 in the shop. Commissioner Ruggles went outside, the interstate was busy and recorded a continuous sound level of 72 dba. It was louder outside than inside. From the shop to the west property line is 130 ft. and this is where Commissioner Ruggles wants to give assurances that noise from scientific and engineering standpoints is not going to be a problem. Because Commissioner Ruggles ran a worst-case situation where noise levels in the shop would be right at the OSHA maximum for 8-hour exposure, that is 90 dba. The type of construction will mitigate that sound level by 35 dba to about 55 right outside the door of the shop. 55 dba if there was no other sound outside would be at a level of 2.3 dba at the property line, and that is the shortest distance to the property line. Next thing he ran was how much does that contribute to the overall sound level that the applicant recorded of 45, which is the average or continuous equivalent sound level on the west property line. The calculator Commissioner Ruggles uses will not run out that many decimal places with zeros to the left. So, if you have 45 dba at that property line and noise levels are well beyond what Commissioner Ruggles would ever expect in a shop of this type, running the equipment he is running, it is literally zero contribution to the sound level. This is the basis Commissioner Ruggles wants to bring to our attention, to show us what affects what, and

fact that sound levels had been brought up he felt they had to be addressed in a logical manner based on good science and engineering.

In depth analysis was done.

Vice-Chair Burton makes the findings and has no problem with anything here and is okay with the waiver.

Commissioner Walsh makes the finding and is okay with the waiver, although thinks the sign could have remained larger.

Commissioner Williams makes the findings and is in favor of the waiver.

Commissioner Toehe is great with the conditions lined out. Approves. Commends applicant for the thought of teaching other people.

Chair Ontiveros makes the findings, approves the waiver. Compliment the applicant that he is teaching this trait to others and feels this is very important.

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles approves CUP-23-010 with conditions as revised by staff.

SECOND: Commissioner Williams seconded the motion.

DISCUSSION: N/A

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

IV. CALL TO PUBLIC FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

No one from the public spoke.

Chair Ontiveros adjourned the hearing at 6:02 pm.

V. CONTINUATION OF STUDY SESSION IF NEEDED



Chairperson, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission

ATTEST:



Secretary, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission